Was There Really an Archean Phosphate Crisis?

Kurt O. Konhauser,1* Stefan V. Lalonde,1 Larry Amskold,1 Heinrich D. Holland2

It has been suggested that sedimenting particles of ferric oxyhydroxide may have stripped dissolved phosphate from the ocean’s photic zone during the Archean (1), when massive amounts of iron were deposited in the form of banded iron formations (BIF). Hypothesized phosphate concentrations of only 10 to 25% of the present-day values would have led to a reduction in phytoplankton productivity and, therefore, to lower rates of oxygen production and organic carbon burial. This model is predicated on the observation that ferric oxyhydroxide particles, resulting from the oxidation of Fe(II) in some modern submarine hydrothermal systems, sorb phosphate with a distribution coefficient ($K_D$) value of about 0.06 μM$^{-1}$ (2).

However, compared with the modern ocean, the Archean ocean had substantially higher concentrations of dissolved silica, at least as high as at saturation with cristobalite (0.67 mM at 40°C in seawater) and possibly even at saturation with amorphous silica (2.20 mM) (3); modern oceans average <0.10 mM (4). Silica strongly sorbs to ferric oxyhydroxides, and, at the proposed concentration of phosphate in the Archean ocean [ranging from 0.03 to 0.29 μM (1)], silica could effectively compete with phosphate for available sorption sites [on the basis of α-FeOOH adsorption constants (5)]. Furthermore, iron-silica coprecipitation diminishes the resulting particle’s point of zero net charge (PZNC) (6), rendering it less reactive to dissolved anions.

We determined the significance of high silica concentrations on phosphate sorption in two ways: (i) by using preformed ferrihydrite particles to demonstrate the competitive adsorption between silica and phosphate at different pH values and (ii) by oxidizing Fe(II) to precipitate ferrihydrite, in the presence of silica and phosphate, for the determination of $K_D$ values (7). In the first instance, maximum phosphate adsorption onto preformed ferrihydrite particles occurs at pH 7 and in the absence of silica (Fig. 1A); silica outcompetes phosphate as silica concentration increases. Furthermore, ferric-iron incorporating silica shows a consistent decrease in PZNC (Fig. 1B) and correspondingly adsorbs even less phosphate (stippled lines in Fig. 1A).

Coprecipitation experiments with an initial Fe(II) concentration of 0.2 mM revealed that the presence of silica reduced the phosphate content of the resulting particles (Fig. 1C). In the complete absence of silica, we calculated a $K_D$ value of 0.075 ± 0.003 μM$^{-1}$, similar to the $K_D$ value used by Bjerrum and Canfield (1) for particles formed at modern submarine hydrothermal vents [compare with (2)], whereas $K_D$ values decreased to 0.011 ± 0.004 μM$^{-1}$ and 0.002 ± 0.002 μM$^{-1}$ for solutions near cristobalite and amorphous silica saturation, respectively. Additionally, we observed silica to exert an even greater effect at lower dissolved Fe concentrations [0.02 mM Fe (fig. S6)]. Consequently, our calculated $K_D$ values are conservative at 0.2 mM Fe, especially considering that previous estimates of dissolved Fe concentrations for the Archean ocean are around 0.05 mM (8). Only at much higher dissolved Fe concentrations (e.g., ~2 mM), such as in some hydrothermal vent fluids, does the effect of silica on phosphate sorption become negligible (fig. S6).

With the use of the P:Fe ratio in BIF as a proxy for dissolved phosphate concentrations in the Archean ocean [as the authors of (1) used, with whom we compare our data], we calculated that average dissolved phosphate concentrations would have ranged from 0.14 ± 0.01 μM (no silica) to 5.25 ± 2.63 μM in an amorphous silica-saturated ocean. The latter value is of the same order of magnitude as modern oceans (2.3 μM (1)). Importantly, there would have been diagenetic remobilization of phosphate during burial (probably leading to lower P:Fe ratios in BIF). Thus, the actual dissolved phosphate concentrations could have been even higher. If the Archean ocean contained abundant dissolved silica, as is generally believed, sedimenting ferrihydrite particles would not have been a major sink for phosphate. It is unlikely that there was a phosphate crisis, and a related reduction in phytoplankton productivity, caused by BIF deposition in the Archean ocean.

References and Notes

7. Materials and methods are available as supporting material on Science Online.
9. We thank A. Kappler, A. Knoll, S. Smith, and three anonymous reviewers for comments on this manuscript. This work was supported by Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council Discovery grant 249565-02.

Supporting Online Material

www.sciencemag.org/cgi/content/full/315/5816/1234/DC1

Materials and Methods

Figs. S1 to S8

Tables S3 to S7

References

16 October 2006; accepted 19 December 2006 10.1126/science.1136328

*To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail: kurtk@ualberta.ca